In 1911 the Royal Scottish Museum (RSM) in Edinburgh received by bequest the numismatic collection of the late Major Donald Lindsay Carnegie of Spynie and Boysack. Unfortunately there was very little accompanying documentation, comprising only copies of parts of the will and some legal correspondence, and the collection appears not to have been given a great deal of attention since its acquisition. The only museum documentation until recent years comprised a manuscript volume in the handwriting of Robert Kerr, who retired from his curatorship at the RSM in 1954. This contains only a very brief list of the coins with accession numbers.

The present writer first became aware of the collection in the 1990s, while working on the documentation of the coin collection at the National Museum of Antiquities of Scotland (NMAS). (Although the RSM and NMAS had amalgamated under the banner of the National Museums of Scotland (NMS) in 1985, the numismatic collections remained physically separate on their two sites until 1996, when the NMAS collections and staff were transferred to the RSM site.) As an extension of the NMAS programme, the Scottish element of the RSM collections, including coins from the Lindsay Carnegie collection, was included in the documentation project. Once the physical amalgamation of the RSM and NMAS collections had been accomplished, it became clear that the Lindsay Carnegie collection was not only extensive but contained a significant number of very important coins.

It was also apparent that the collection was unknown outwith the bounds of the National Museums of Scotland. Since it had been transferred in its entirety to the RSM, and no items from the collection had ever appeared on the market, neither dealers nor collectors were aware of its existence, and so well kept was the secret that even Lord Stewartby, when writing his article entitled 'Scottish Coin Collectors' for publication in this Journal, was unable to include it. This paper is therefore intended to be a long overdue tribute to a discerning collector and a very generous benefactor to Scotland's national collection.

The collector

Donald Christian Strachan Lindsay Carnegie was born on 9 July 1840, the third son of William Fullerton Lindsay Carnegie of Spynie. Regrettably few details of his life are available, apart from the bare bones of a military career. Records held at the Scottish National War Museum reveal that he joined the army with the rank of Second Lieutenant on 20 March 1858, and was promoted to Lieutenant on 21 June of the same year, to Captain on 4 August 1865, and to Major on 3 December 1876. He was posted to India (date unknown), and held the post of Officiating Squadron Commander, 17th Bengal Cavalry, at some time in or after 1877. After that, little is known of Lindsay Carnegie's life until he succeeded his brother, Henry Alexander, as Laird on the death of the latter on 14 November 1908. He died on 16 May 1911, and was succeeded by his nephew, David Crawford Fullerton Rutherford Lindsay Carnegie. Unfortunately no edition of

Acknowledgement: Thanks are due to Antonia Butler, a postgraduate student at Edinburgh University and volunteer worker at the National Museums of Scotland, who searched diligently through the NMS coin collections for Lindsay Carnegie coins still accompanied by his tickets.

Burke's Landed Gentry was published between 1906 and 1914; had there been an entry for Donald as Laird, details of his later life would have been included.

The obituary which appeared in The Scotsman on the day following his death was short and not very informative. We learn that he retired from the army to live in St Andrews (6 Playfair Terrace was his address until his death), and that he was elected a member of the Royal and Ancient Golf Club in 1873. (There must be some doubt as to whether this date is correct, since it is clear that his period of service in India continued for at least another four years.) He was Hon. President of the St Andrews Conservative Club, and 'a generous supporter of St Andrews and other philanthropic institutions'. It is noteworthy that his collecting activities were regarded as sufficiently significant to be included in the obituary. Lindsay Carnegie is there described as 'a keen numismatist' and as having 'one of the finest collections of British gold coins in the country'.

The first record of Major Lindsay Carnegie's official involvement in numismatics came with his election to membership of the Numismatic Society of London on 15 December 1898. He was still a member of what had by then become the Royal Numismatic Society at the time of his death, which was announced at the Society's AGM in 1911. He was also a founder member of the British Numismatic Society and appears in the Society's membership lists from 1903 onwards.²

The question of when and whence Lindsay Carnegie acquired his coins is one to which there are only tantalising clues. Only a very small proportion of the collection is now accompanied by collector's tickets, but these do reveal that he was a regular purchaser at Sotheby's London sales between 1896 and 1904. Since he had apparently resided in Scotland for some twenty years prior to this, we must assume that he had not previously had the desire and/or the resources to purchase at such sales. The size of the Indian section of his collection (see below) does suggest that he may have collected this series for longer than any other, and his interests may have continued to lie there for some time after his return to Britain.

The bequest

The will of Major Lindsay Carnegie, dated 20 January 1909, included the following: 'I direct my Trustees as soon as they shall find convenient after my death to deliver and hand over to the Edinburgh Museum of Science and Art [subsequently renamed the Royal Scottish Museum] for preservation in that Museum, in so far as I may not have handed them over in my lifetime, my Collection of Coins with the iron safe which I use for keeping the same and all numismatic books belonging to me, [and other items] . . . – the whole to be held by the Officials for the time being of said Museum for the following purposes and subject to the following powers and provisos, videlicet:– that they should make provision for the said Collection of coins being properly arranged and classified by some competent person (preferably an expert amateur) and thereafter have the same and other articles bequeathed to them as aforesaid placed and kept in the said Museum for inspection by the Public under such proper safeguards as the Director for the time being of said Museum may consider adequate for their protection, and I express a hope that as the said coins will form at least the nucleus for a good collection, others may be induced to add to it or contribute funds for providing additions to it, . . .'

The words underlined would seem to suggest that Lindsay Carnegie did not feel that he himself had been able to catalogue his collection satisfactorily, and this is borne out by what appears in Kerr’s manuscript register, in which the descriptions of some of the coins, possibly copied from older lists then discarded, are inadequate and sometimes inaccurate. It also appears that LC did not have a high opinion of the abilities of the professional curators of his day!

The will continues: ' . . . and I hereby leave and bequeath and direct my Trustees to pay at the first term of Whitsunday or Martinmas after my death and free of Government duty, if any, to the Director for the time being of said Museum and the Secretary of the Scotch Education Department [sic] for the time being the sum of Two thousand pounds to be held by them and their successors

² I am grateful to Hugh Pagan for this information from the archives of the British Numismatic Society.
in office in trust to apply the income derived therefrom from time to time in defraying any cost involved in connection with the arranging and custody of said Collection of Coins and in the purchase of Coins to add to the Collection, and I empower the Director of the said Museum for the time being, if he thinks fit to do so, to sell any duplicates of coins that may be in the said collection, the nett proceeds, however being always applied for the purpose of adding to and improving the said Collection; . . .'

Museum records show that money from the Lindsay Carnegie Fund was used frequently to purchase coins between 1912 and the late 1920s, but apparently with decreasing frequency thereafter. Numismatic books were also acquired for the museum library. Kerr’s register records only one sale, of two Scottish gold coins to a private collector in 1934. By the 1990s inflation had severely devalued what was left in the fund. Some of the money was used to purchase new coin cabinets, and in 2002 what remained was used as part of the NMS Charitable Trust’s contribution towards the purchase of the Mary and Darnley marriage ryal at Spink’s November sale. It was felt that Major Lindsay Carnegie would have approved of the employment of the last part of his bequest to bring this important coin back to Scotland.

The collection

The register compiled by Robert Kerr lists 3344 separate items, but a number of these are multiple entries, and the total number of coins and other items must be over 3500. This figure includes 205 Scottish coins, 512 English to the death of Queen Anne, 553 British from George I to Edward VII, 159 ‘British Possessions’, 415 European and ‘Possessions of European Countries’ and 187 other foreign (America and Africa). The section headed ‘Coins of India (etc)’ contains 930 entries, covering everything from ancient Indo-Greek and Kushan coins to British Imperial issues for India and other parts of Asia. There are 71 coins of China, Japan and Korea, and the remaining items include further Asian coins, non-coin money and amulets, a few classical coins, some banknotes, trade tokens, medals and paranumismatica.

This brief description of the collection will concentrate largely on those areas likely to be of the greatest interest to readers of this Journal. From the figures given above, it might appear that Major Lindsay Carnegie was something of a magpie in his collecting preferences, but this would be unjust. While he was in India, it would have been natural for him to collect those coin series to which he would have had ready access. In the purchases he is known to have made in the 1890s and 1900s he showed an eye for quality and a particular interest in proof and pattern issues, and a number of his acquisitions were items of considerable rarity.

It is extremely unfortunate that so little evidence of provenance survives. The small number of tickets bearing Lindsay Carnegie’s handwriting which still exist show that he kept meticulous records of when and where he acquired his coins, and it is not easy to understand why these few have survived whilst all the others were apparently thrown away. In addition to the sources attested in NMS records or on the tickets, it has been possible to establish others by means of a careful study of the catalogues of sales at which Lindsay Carnegie is known to have purchased. He apparently employed Spink and Son as his bidding agent from at least 1896, switching to W.S. Lincoln and Son at some time between the Preston sale of November 1900 and the Clarkson sale of April 1901. A number of coins acquired by these bidders have been identified as Lindsay Carnegie specimens either through illustrations in the catalogues or through written descriptions which contain particularly distinctive details, and a full list of these is appended to this paper.

Scottish Coins

The Scottish section of the collection is modest in size, but generally of high quality, and it contains a number of rarities. It is also important in that many of the coins have recorded provenances. (These were mostly noted by someone at the RSM, but all the original evidence has now
vanished.) By far the most frequently attested source is the Pollexfen sale of June 1900 (Manville and Robertson 193.29), from which museum records state that Lindsay Carnegie acquired forty-nine Scottish pieces, with another three now identified from plates. There are seventeen coins recorded as from the Murdoch sale of May 1903 (M 201.25), and another four subsequently identified, and a further nine from Carfrae (July 1901) (M 196.30). Two James VIII patterns came from Grant Morris (April 1898), and one coin each from Rae (1898), Clarkson (1901), Bain (1901) and Cholmley (1902). One coin, a silver ryal of Mary (1567), is recorded as being 'Young, 1898, lot 766', but no such sale is recorded by Manville and Robertson. In addition to these Sotheby’s sale purchases, twelve Scottish coins were bought at Dowells in George Street, Edinburgh, mostly at the sale on 22–23 December 1899 (M 188.54), but one on 12 June 1905 and two on 22 October or 22 December 1906. Neither of these latter sales is recorded by Manville and Robertson, but they are of interest here, since Lindsay Carnegie appears to have ceased to purchase coins regularly at London sales by this time.

There is little early material, with only sixteen coins predating the commencement of Robert III’s issues in 1390, but these include sterlings of Earl Henry and Malcolm IV (Murdoch lots 4 and 5). The later mediaeval elements of the collection comprise largely gold coins, with four of Robert III (including a light Lion), seven of James I, eight of James II (one sold), nine of James III (one sold), four of James IV (including a lion) and six of James V. Of these six kings, by contrast, there are only six silver groats and one billion penny.

The majority of the Scottish coins are of the later Stuart monarchs, commencing with Mary, who is represented by forty-four coins and five jetons. All the first period gold issues are represented by one or more specimens, and the nineteen silver coins include five with portraits. The thirty-six coins of James VI include a complete type set of the pre-Union gold, the twenty-pound piece (1576) being ex Clarkson lot 461; of particular note is the full set of a lion noble with its two-thirds and one-third fractions, all purchased at the Murdoch sale. The silver series has some gaps, but does include a worn specimen of the 1582 forty shillings (ex Cholmley sale lot 270). The gold and silver series of James VI’s post-Union coinage (four and one coins) and of Charles I (four and nine) are patchily represented, but oddly there are seventeen Charles I copper turners of the second and third issues. Given Lindsay Carnegie’s evident lack of interest in the base metal coinages in general, it may be that these coins came from a hoard, perhaps found on his own estate. Certainly many of them bear evidence of corrosion. There is nothing much of note among the coins of Charles II to Anne, except for a William II gold pistole (twelve pounds Scots) of the Darien issue, which is unfortunately unprovenanced.

Given the short period during which Lindsay Carnegie appears to have been actively collecting Scottish coins, he undoubtedly managed to acquire many fine specimens. He was fortunate, of course, that some large collections, particularly those of Pollexfen and Murdoch, came onto the market at this time, and one is left with the impression that, had he started earlier and/or continued for longer, he might well have formed a collection to rival those.

**English coins, to the death of Queen Anne**

Unlike the Scottish coins, only two of Lindsay Carnegie’s English coins from the same period retained a recorded provenance. A silver pattern farthing of Charles II (1676) is still accompanied by one of LC’s own tickets, stating that the coin came from lot 105 in a sale on 29 June 1903. This must have been Sotheby’s ‘Anon’ (Nobleman / Marquess of Ailesbury) sale (M 202.38). A copper pattern farthing of Queen Anne is similarly recorded as from the Temple sale of 1901 (M 196.45). Others have been identified from catalogues, including items from the following sales: Montagu II, III and V (May and November 1896, November 1897), Durlacher (March 1899), Moon (May 1901), Cholmley (May 1902), Murdoch (March-April and June 1903) and Brinning (March 1908), the latter representing a late outlier from the recognised pattern of Lindsay Carnegie’s

---

purchases. The lack of documentation is frustrating, since there are many high quality coins, particularly gold, in this series, and it is fair to assume that many of them must have been purchased at major London sales.

As with the Scottish series, there are few coins from the earlier mediaeval period – one penny of William the Conqueror and a miscellaneous assemblage of Edwardian pennies and fractions – and there is again a preponderance of gold amongst the later mediaeval coins, including issues from the Anglo-Gallic series. There are nine gold coins of Edward III, including two Anglo-Gallic, and four Anglo-Gallic of Edward, the Black Prince. Of Richard II there are five gold (including one Anglo-Gallic), of Henry IV one, of Henry V three, of Henry VI nine (four Anglo-Gallic), of Edward IV eleven and of Richard III two. There are also silver groats of the latter four kings.

Again as with the Scottish coinage, it seems to have been the issues of the early modern period, particularly of the later sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, which held the greatest appeal for Major Lindsay Carnegie. His collection contained reasonable numbers of coins of all the Tudor and Stuart monarchs, many in excellent condition, but within this part of the series there are a significant number of rare individual pieces. The following selection will serve to indicate the quality of the collection.

Henry VII: sovereign, type IV (North 1692/1).4

Henry VIII: 1st coinage sovereign (N. 1759/1); 2nd coinage sovereign (N. 1782), George-noble (N. 1785/1); 3rd coinage sovereign, Southwark (N. 1825).

Edward VI: 1st period crown (N. 1894); 2nd period sovereign (N. 1906); 3rd period sovereign (N. 1927); patterns: half-sovereign (N. 1950), crown (N. 1951).

Mary: sovereign (N. 1956).

Philip and Mary: angel (N. 1965).

Elizabeth I: 3rd issue sovereign (N. 2003), ryals (2) (N. 2004), pounds (3) (N. 2008); milled half-pound (N. 2019/4)

James I: 1st coinage crown (N. 2068); 2nd coinage rose ryal (N. 2079), spur ryal (N. 2080), angel (N. 2081), half-angel (N. 2082); 3rd coinage rose ryals (3) (N. 2108), spur ryal (N. 2109).

Charles I: Oxford mint triple unites (3) (N. 2382, 2384, 2385), unites (2) (N. 2389), half-unite (N. 2395); gold pattern: unites (N. 2655), unite or shilling (N. 2660).

There are fourteen Civil War siege coinage pieces, from Scarborough, Pontefract, Newark and Carlisle.

Commonwealth: patterns: half-crowns by Blondeau (ESC 443) and Ramage (ESC 445).

Oliver Cromwell: fifty shillings (?) (N. 2743), broad (N. 2744), crown (ESC 10), Dutch silver-gilt copy (ESC 11A), copy by Tanner (ESC 13), half-crown (ESC 1656) (ESC 446).

Charles II: 5 guineas (1673, 1682, 1684); patterns: gold crown by Roettiers (1662) (ESC 69), ‘Petition’ crown by Thomas Simon (1663) (ESC 72), silver broads (N. 2776, 2777, 2779), farthings in tin (Peck 458), pewter (P. 490) and silver (P. 492) (5 specimens).

The ‘Petition’ crown is the Murdoch sale specimen, lot 640.

James II: 5 guineas (1688).

William and Mary: 5 guineas (1692, 1693).

William III: 5 guineas (1699, 1700); proofs/patterns: crown 1696 (ESC 95), half-crown (ESC 523), farthing (1699) (P. 682).

Anne: 5 guineas (1703 VIGO, 1706); patterns: guinea (1702) (Wilson and Rasmussen 59), shilling (1710) (ESC 1155A), halfpenny (P. 724), farthings (1713 silver, 1714) (P. 752, 741).

The VIGO 5 guineas is from the Durlacher sale (March 1899). The pattern guinea may well be lot 387 in the Moon sale (ex Montagu, Brice, Bergne, Maydwell, anon (Duke of Devonshire).

The above list contains only those items which might be described as the most ‘collectable’ today, and does not reflect the range of denominations present. All the proof/pattern pieces have been included, however, as these were clearly among Lindsay Carnegie’s particular interests. This will become more apparent in the next section, since many more such pieces were struck in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries.
As with the earlier English material, it will only be possible here to list some of the most important individual coins from each reign. Although Lindsay Carnegie's obituary referred specifically to his British gold coins, it is the high proportion of proof and pattern pieces which would in addition mark out his collection as exceptional today.

George I: 5 guineas (1726), guinea (1726 elephant and castle, mint state); patterns: guinea (1727) (WR 66); silver proofs: halfpenny and farthing (1717, P 771 and 786).

George II: 5 guineas (1729, 1741, 1746, 1753); gold proofs / patterns: 5 guineas (1731, WR 68), 2 guineas (1733, WR 69), guinea (1729, WR 73), half guinea (1728, WR 75); silver proofs / patterns: crown (1732, ESC 118), half crown (1731, ESC 594), halfpenny (1729, P 833), farthing (1730, P 855).

George III: gold patterns / proofs: 5 guineas (1770, WR 76; 1777, WR 78), 2 guineas (1768, WR 79), guinea (2 x 1763, WR 87, 2 x 1774, WR 95, 1787, WR 104, 2 x 1813, WR 120, 122), half guinea (1775, WR 129), third guinea (1776, WR 137), quarter guinea (1764, WR 141), Bank of England dollar (undated trial double obverse, WR 147), 5 pounds (1820, WR 177), 2 pounds (1820, WR 179), sovereign (1816, WR 192), crown (1817, WR 209); silver patterns / proofs: Bank of England dollar (1804, ESC 160), crowns (undated, ESC 221; 1817, ESC 223; 1817, ESC 229), half crown (1816, ESC 615), shillings (1764, ESC 1238; 1787, ESC 1226 (proof), ESC 1241 (pattern), sixpences (ESC 1640); copper patterns / proofs: pennies (1806, P 1326, P 1327), halfpennies (1788, P 1005; 1795, P 1055; 1797, P 1172; 1799, P 1233 (gilt), P 1234, P 1258; 1805, P 1309; 1806, P 1363, P 1364), farthings (1799, P 1270; 1806, P 1388).

The most significant of the George III pieces is clearly the 1817 pattern crown in gold – the so-called 'Three Graces' type. Only three specimens are currently known to exist, and the other two have both passed through the market in recent years (Spink, London, sale 131, 2 March 1999, lot 1186; and sale 157, 15 November 2001, lot 545). The catalogue entry for the latter sale includes a history of the whereabouts of the three specimens, as far as was known at the time, and it is clear that the Lindsay Carnegie coin is the one there described as 'Montagu 1'. Last recorded in the Brunning sale (Sotheby, 18 March 1908), at which it was purchased by Edgar Lincoln, presumably acting as agent for Lindsay Carnegie. (As previously noted, LC is not known to have participated in any other London sales after 1904, but the lure of this particular piece was clearly sufficient to entice him to one more sale, at which he also made a number of other purchases.) The pattern crown can thus confidently be described as 'ex Brunning. Moon, Montagu, Addington, Sainthill', taking its history back to the Sainthill sale of 1870.

Of the other Lindsay Carnegie coins, the 1777 pattern 5 guineas by Yeo is definitely the Murdoch specimen (March 1904, lot 121), this being confirmed by the illustration in the sale catalogue. Among other Murdoch coins bought by Lincoln which are probably the Lindsay Carnegie specimens is the double-obverse gold pattern dollar (1860, P 1855-6).

William IV: gold patterns / proofs: 2 pounds (1831, WR 258), sovereign (1831, WR 262), half sovereign (1831, WR 267); silver patterns / proofs: crowns (2 x 1831, ESC 271), halfcrowns (2 x 1831, ESC 657; 2 x 1834, ESC 661, 663), shillings (2 x 1831, ESC 1266), sixpences (3 x 1831, ESC 1671, 2 x 1672; 1834, ESC 1674A), groats (4 x 1836, ESC 1919, 1920, 1924, 1927); copper proofs: penny (1831, P 1457), halfpenny (1831, P 1465); farthing (1831, P 1468).

Victoria: gold patterns / proofs: 5 pounds (2 x 1839, WR 277, 278; 1887, WR 286; 1893, WR 287), 2 pounds (1887, WR 291, 1893, WR 294), sovereigns (1837, WR 296; 1838, WR 299; 1839, WR 303; 1853, WR 305; 1871, WR 319; 1880, WR 323; 1887, WR 333; 1888, WR 335; 1893, WR 341), half-sovereigns (1839, WR 343; 1853, WR 346; 1860, WR 355; 1887, WR 362; 1888, WR 369; 1893, WR 363), double florins (1868, WR 372), Maundy set (1838, WR 382), ducats (2 x 1867, WR 388), penny (Lauer for Weyl 1860, WR 389); silver patterns / proofs: crowns (1857 Bonomi, ESC 320, 2 x 1839, ESC 279, ESC p. 67, note 1; 1845, ESC 338A; 1846, ESC 341; 1847, ESC 288; 1853, ESC 293; 1893, ESC 304), double florins (2 x 1887, ESC 394A, 396), half-crowns (1839, ESC 670; 1853, ESC 687; 1887, ESC 720; 1893, ESC 727), florins (4 x 1848, ESC 889, 902, 904, 905, 1853, ESC 809; 1887, ESC 869; 1893, ESC 877), shillings (1839, ESC 1282; 1853, ESC 1301; 3 x 1863, ESC 1372; 1373, 1374; 1887, ESC 1352), farnc / 10 pence (1867, ESC 1476), sixpences (1839, ESC 1685; 1853, ESC 1699; 1856, ESC 1774; 1893, ESC 1763); groats (1839, ESC 1933; 1853, ESC 1950), threepences (2 x 1887, ESC 2097), Maundy set (1853, ESC 2464); copper proofs: 5 farthings / 10 centimes (1857, P 1971-2), pennies (1839, P 1479; 1853, P 1502), halfpennies (1839, P 1523; 1853, P 1541), farthings (1839, P 1556; 1853, P 1579); bronze patterns / proofs: penny (1860, P 2053-4), halfpenny (1860, P 1751), farthing (1860, P 1855-6).
From the above list it is worth drawing attention to the pattern or proof half-sovereigns dated 1888 and 1889, which are not published by Wilson and Rasmussen. In addition to the above, the Victorian section of the collection includes a complete run of Maundy sets, which may comprise largely the series from 1838 to 1889 which formed lot 504 in the Moon sale (May 1901) and was purchased by Lincoln.

The coinage of Edward VII comprises only the gold and silver denominations issued in 1902, some duplicated, plus a single farthing of the same year, except that the run of Maundy sets continues up to and including 1909. Lindsay Carnegie’s obituary stated that he had been in poor health for some time prior to his death, and this appears to be reflected in a failure to add to his collection in the last years of his life.

**Irish coinage**

The Irish section of the collection is small, but includes examples of the various issues of the reign of Charles I (‘Inchiquin’, ‘Dublin’, ‘Ormonde’ and ‘Rebel’). The two most notable pieces are pattern pennies by Thomas Wyon for George III (1813) and George IV (1822) (Dowle and Finn 611 and 637). These were purchased at the Murdoch sale (12–13 December 1904) as lots 31 and 35.

**British colonial coinage**

The section of Kerr’s manuscript register headed ‘British Possessions’ contains 159 entries, but this figure is somewhat misleading, since it includes some coins (Victorian fractional farthings, coins of the Channel Islands and Isle of Man), which would not normally be regarded as colonial today, but excludes the coins of British India, which are very numerous. Since it is not proposed to deal in any detail with the non-colonial Indian coinage in this Journal, those issued under British authority will be included here. As with previous groups, the following list will comprise only those pieces which appear to the present writer to be the highlights of the collection.

British trade coinage: Elizabeth I portcullis money, 8, 4 and 2 testerns and 1 testern (1600, Pridmore 2.330–2. 1–4). Victoria British trade dollars, gold and silver proofs (1895, Pr2. 334. 1B and 2A).

American colonies: Carolina ‘elephant’ token (1694), Massachusetts ‘pine tree’ coinage shilling (1652), ‘Rosa Americana’ coinage halfpennies (2 × 1722 [D G REX and DEI GRATIA REX], 1723), twopence (1723).

Bahamas: George III copper proof pennies (1806, engrafted edge and plain edge, Pridmore 3.73.1A and 2). Canada: (province) silver proof 5, 10 and 20 cents (1858); Newfoundland gold 2 dollars (1880, 1881, 2 × 1882H, 1885).

Essequibo and Demarara: George III silver 3 guilders (1816) (mint state).

Australia: Adelaide pound (2 × 1852, plain and dentilated border); Sydney mint sovereigns (1855, 1866), half-sovereign (1857); Victoria (state) gold pattern sixpence and shilling (1855).

Ionian Islands: William IV 30 lepta proof (1834, Pridmore 1.79.9A).

Hong Kong: Victoria dollar (1866, Pr2. 280. 1) and proof dollar (1866, Pr2. 281. 1A); pattern Shanghai tael (1867, Pr2. 319.315) (possibly Clarkson lot 521).

Gold Coast: George III silver proof ackey and half-ackey (1818).

Griqualand: George III copper quarter penny and half penny, silver 5 pence and 10 pence (nd. 1815–6).

Mombasa: Victoria silver proof rupee (1888H), 2 annas, quarter and half rupee (1890H).

Sierra Leone: George III silver proof 10, 20, 50, 100 cents (1791).

India: Bengal Presidency – 34 coins, including 5 gold, East India Co. copper 6 pice token (nd – 1757, Pridmore 4/1. 244. 187), copper 1 pie pattern (1809, Pr 4/1. 269–70. 389); Bombay Presidency – 12 coins, including silver PAX DEO rupee (nd – 1678, Pr4/1. 149. 16), silver pattern rupee (1678, Pr4/1. 150. 20), copper pattern mohur (1828).

---

10 Pridmore, as in n.9, Part 3, West Indies (London, 1965: hereafter abbreviated as Pr3).
11 Pridmore, as in n.9, Part 1, European Territories (London, 1960).
12 Pridmore, as in n.9, Part 4, India, Volume 1 (London, 1980: hereafter abbreviated as Pr4/1).
PR4/1. 178. 336); Madras Presidency - 72 coins, including 17 gold; East India Company (All India coinage) - 30 coins, including 5 gold; British imperial issues - 39 coins, including silver proof 2 annas, quarter rupee, half rupee and rupee (1861), 2 x gold mohurs (1862), silver proof, 5 rupees, 10 rupees, 1 mohur and gold proof 1 mohur (1870), silver proof 2 annas, quarter rupee, half rupee, 1 rupee (1891), silver proof 2 annas, quarter rupee (1903), bronze proof quarter anna and silver proof rupee (1905); Dewas State (senior branch), Victoria proof one-twelfth and one-quarter anna proof (1888. Pridmore 4/2.172. 1021, 1016).\(^{13}\)

Other British Empire coinage includes proof issues of Ceylon, Sarawak, British North Borneo and Sumatra.

**Foreign coins**

The Lindsay Carnegie collection contains large numbers of coins from all over the world, ranging from choice historic gold pieces to late nineteenth-century small change in worn condition. Highlights include French mediaeval gold, Spanish and Latin American gold and gold coins of the United States of America. Among the large Indian sections are many coins of the Mughal Empire – among them gold pieces and ‘zodiac’ issues of Jahangir, both originals and later copies.

Evidence for Lindsay Carnegie’s particular interest in Royal Mint proof and pattern issues, already present in his collection of British coins, is reinforced by his acquisition of a number of extremely rare pattern pieces struck for Colombia and Peru.\(^{14}\)

The Colombian set, dated 1873, comprises silver proof issues in denominations of 10, 5 and 2 pesos, 1 peso, 5 and 2 decimos and half decimo. The first four are similar in appearance to standard gold issues of the period, and the last three to the normal silver coins. The 20 pesos has *L C WYON* on the truncation, and the 10 pesos *L C W*; the others are unsigned. There is also a large silver proof 1 peso, with *L C WYON* on the truncation, which does not correspond to any coin actually issued. The Royal Mint is known to have supplied dies to Colombia at this time,\(^{15}\) but it is probable that Leonard Wyon’s work was carried out under the terms of a private contract. The trial pieces will have been struck at the Mint to ensure the satisfactory nature of the dies prior to export, but unfortunately there are no records of how many there were. A set was sold at the L.C. Wyon collection sale in December 1901 (lot 90), where it was acquired by Spearing. It reappeared at the Murdoch sale in July 1903 (lot 1082), where Lincoln purchased it, presumably for Lindsay Carnegie. (Murdoch 1082 also contained a gold *quito* of 1835, which Lindsay Carnegie must have disposed of before his death, as it did not form part of the bequest.)

The Peruvian patterns, dated 1886, comprise silver proofs in denominations of 1 sol, half sol, one-fifth sol, 1 dinero and half dinero, and copper proofs of 2 centavos and 1 centavo. (Lindsay Carnegie possessed two specimens of each of the copper pieces.) The full story behind these issues can be obtained in a published paper by Horace Flatt,\(^{16}\) but in summary the effects of defeat in a war with Chile left the mint in Lima requiring new equipment, and in the absence of qualified personnel in Peru, the contract for matrices was awarded to Leonard Wyon at the Royal Mint in London. Trial dies were prepared, but errors had been made in both the size of the matrices and the design of the copper denominations. Six sets of proof coins were supplied to the Peruvian government, and eventually it was found necessary to use Wyon’s matrices, despite the errors, to prepare new dies for the regular coinage, thus giving the proof sets the status of patterns. A record dated 5 March 1886 records the supply of 13.81 ounces of silver to Wyon for ‘nine sets of proofs’, although only six sets were actually supplied to Peru. One set was part of Leonard Wyon’s own collection, and was purchased by Lincoln, presumably for Lindsay Carnegie, at the sale of this collection in December 1901 (lot 95).

\(^{13}\) Pridmore, as in n 9, *Part 4, India, Volume 2* (London, 1980).

\(^{14}\) I am indebted to Dr. Kevin Clancy, Curator of the Royal Mint Museum, for supplying information on the background to the striking of the Colombian pieces and for a copy of the article by Flatt cited in n 16.

\(^{15}\) Royal Mint *Annual Report* for 1874.

Summary

How, therefore, should we assess the Lindsay Carnegie collection as a whole? It seems likely that its formation passed through several distinct phases, despite the lack of a considerable amount of hard and fast evidence. The accumulation of large numbers of coins of India and neighbouring countries, under both British and native rulers, must presumably be traced back to the earlier part of Lindsay Carnegie's adult life, spent in the army in India. If he returned to Britain with an established interest in this area of numismatics, he may well have continued to add to this part of his collection in succeeding years, but we have no evidence for the direction his collecting took until the late 1890s, some twenty years after he is thought to have left military service. This seems a sustainable hypothesis, however, since some of his surviving tickets indicate that he was still acquiring such pieces late in his life (see below).

We know that, between 1898 and 1904 Lindsay Carnegie was a frequent purchaser from Sotheby's London sales, with a few recorded acquisitions coming towards the end of his life, although by then his bidding activity seems to have been substantially reduced. The coins which he is known to have bought during this period belong overwhelmingly to the British Isles / British Empire series, but we have no idea whether he was also a collector in the former field earlier in his life. The fact that he did not join the Numismatic Society of London until 1898 does suggest, however, that he may not have regarded himself as a serious collector until around this time. The range of the British and Empire section of his collection closely parallels that of Murdoch, in that it comprises mainly material from the Tudor period and later and is particularly strong in proof and pattern issues. This certainly reflects the fact that he is known to have bought many coins at the Murdoch sales, and probably acquired many more than can now be confirmed (see below), but it can also be demonstrated that he was acquiring such items prior to the dispersal of the Murdoch collection.

For other sections of the collection, notably the European coins and those of the American continent, we have very little information. What can be said is that the breadth of the entire collection, and the range of coins represented within particular series, demonstrate quite clearly that Lindsay Carnegie was not in any sense a 'completist'. He was not the sort of collector who could devote himself to a particular field and seek to acquire every possible variety within it. On the contrary, he seems to have bought simply on the basis of what appealed to him. The wide variation in quality between coins within particular series may indicate that increasing wealth enabled Lindsay Carnegie to acquire more expensive coins later in his life, but it may also be the case that some of the lesser material, particularly coins which may still have been in circulation during his lifetime, came into his collection as change left over from foreign trips made by himself or others who were willing to hand such material over to him.

The effect of the bequest on the collections of the Royal Scottish Museum was outstandingly beneficial. It served to place rare and high quality pieces into almost all sections of the museum's existing collections, and these pieces in turn provided a context for the acquisition of others, many purchased with money from the Lindsay Carnegie Fund. It can therefore be stated with some satisfaction that Lindsay Carnegie's wishes, as set out in his will, have by and large been met, and it has been a pleasant task for the present writer to provide a much overdue acknowledgement.

APPENDIX: LINDSAY CARNEGIE COINS WITH RECORDED PROVENANCE

The coins listed here comprise only those for which a provenance has definitely been established, either from museum records, from Lindsay Carnegie's tickets, or by comparison with catalogue plates and descriptions. A great many other provenances may be suggested, with varying amounts of certainty, and a record of these is kept at the National Museums of Scotland. Numbers in brackets are NMS registration numbers.

Scotland

Grant Morris sale (Sotheby's 22–23 April 1898) (Manville and Robertson 183.26)

Lot 89: James VIII pattern crown and silver pattern guinea (1716), restrikes (A.1911.506.1269, 1268)

Rae sale (Sotheby's 23–24 June 1898) (M 184.38)

Lot 231: Charles I unit, third coinage, Briot's issue (A.1911.506.1212)
Young sale (1898) (M --)
Lot 766: Mary ryal, fifth period (1567) (A.1911.506.1137)

Pollexfen sale (Sotheby's 26–28 June 1900) (M 193.29)
Lot 239: Robert III lion, heavy coinage, first issue (A.1911.506.1082)
Lot 240: Robert III demy, heavy coinage, first issue (A.1911.506.1084)
Lot 241: another similar (A.1911.506.1085)
Lot 256: James I demy, type I (A.1911.506.1086)
Lot 260: another, type II (A.1911.506.1090)
Lot 262: another, type III (A.1911.506.1089)
Lot 266: another similar (A.1911.506.1091)
Lot 268: James I half-demy, ex Wingate (A.1911.506.1092)
Lot 278: James II lion, first issue (A.1911.506.1095)
Lot 279: another, second issue, type II (A.1911.506.1096)
Lot 289: James III groat, Stewart VIg (A.1911.506.1112)
Lot 296: James III rider, type II (A.1911.506.1105)
Lot 297: James III half-rider, type II (A.1911.506.1110)
Lot 303: James IV half-unicorn, Murray z (le) (A.1911.506.1108)
Lot 308: James IV unicorn, Murray Q (Id) (A.1911.506.1114)
Lot 309: James IV half-unicorn, Murray q (Id) (A.1911.506.1116)
Lot 312: James IV lion, type II (A.1911.506.1115)17
Lot 319: James V unicorn, Stewart II (A.1911.506.1119)
Lot 322: James V ducat / bonnet piece (1539) (A.1911.506.1120)
Lot 325: James V two-thirds ducat / bonnet piece (1540) (A.1911.506.1122)
Lot 328: Mary testoon, first period, type I (A.1911.506.1140)
Lot 336: Mary half-testoon, first period, type III (A.1911.506.1153)
Lot 338: Mary crown (A.1911.506.1126)
Lot 339: Mary 20 shillings (1543) (A.1911.506.1127)
Lot 341: Mary 44 shillings (1553, Murray Jia) (A.1911.506.1128)
Lot 342: Mary 22 shillings (1553, Murray LB3) (A.1911.506.1131)
Lot 343: another (Murray I, A1) (A.1911.506.1132)
Lot 344: Mary ryal / noble / 3 pounds (1555) (A.1911.506.1134)
Lot 345: Mary half-ryal / half-noble / 30 shillings (1555) (A.1911.506.1135)
Lot 354: Mary testoon, third period (1561) (A.1911.506.1150)
Lot 356: another (1562) (A.1911.506.1152)
Lot 357: Mary half-testoon, 3rd period (1562) (A.1911.506.1158)
Lot 374: James VI balance half-merk (1592) and quarter-merk (1591) (A.1911.506.1199, 1200)
Lot 380: James VI ducat (1580) (A.1911.506.1175)
Lot 381: James VI thistle noble (A.1911.506.1179)
Lot 387: James VI half-merk (1593) (A.1911.506.1182)
Lot 391: James VI sword and sceptre piece (1603) (A.1911.506.1184)
Lot 402: James VI double crown, first post-Union coinage (A.1911.506.1188)
Lot 410: Charles I 60 shillings, 30 shillings, 12 shillings, 6 shillings, 2 shillings, first coinage (A.1911.506.1215, 1216, 1217, 1220, 1221)
Lot 414: Charles I pattern half-merk (1636) (A.1911.506.1222)
Lot 433: Charles I eighth-unit / half-crown, 3rd coinage, Briot's issue (A.1911.506.1214)
Lot 436: Charles II 4 merks (1664), 2 merks (1673), merk (1664), half-merk (1664) (A.1911.506.1241, 1242, 1243, 1244)
Lot 442: James VII 60 shillings (1688), restrike (A.1911.506.1252)
Lot 451: James VIII pattern crown (1716), restrike (A.1911.506.1270).

Clarkson sale (Sotheby's 16–20 April 1901) (M 195.14)
Lot 461: James VI 20 pounds (1576) (A.1911.506.1174)

Carfrae sale (Sotheby's 8–11 July 1901) (M 196.30)
Lot 379: James I demy, type III (A.1911.506.1088)
Lot 381: James II demy, type IVa (A.1911.506.1093)

17 This is the coin illustrated by Cochran-Patrick in Records of the Coinage of Scotland (1876) as Pl. 17, no. 13. Pollexfen must have acquired it between 1876 and 1900, possibly at the sale at Chapman, Edinburgh, on 14–15 March 1883 (M 130.5).
Lot 389: James II lion, second issue, type II (A.1911.506.1100)
Lot 390: another similar (A.1911.506.1099); NB double lis stop at end of obverse legend, not two annulets as in sale catalogue description
Lot 391: another similar (A.1911.506.1097)
Lot 394: James III quarter-rider, type II (A.1911.506.1111); NB obverse legend ends SCOTORV, reverse legend has no stops and ends DOMIN
Lot 395: James III unicorn, Murray X (la) (A.1911.506.1106); NB stops between all elements of both legends, DE in reverse legend
Lot 401: James IV unicorn, Stewart IIIb (A.1911.506.1113)
Lot 414: James VI rider (1594) (A.1911.506.1181)

Bain sale (Sotheby's 11 July 1901) (M 196.32)
Lot 55: James VI half sword and sceptre piece (1601) (A.1911.506.1185)

Cholmley sale (Sotheby's 26–30 May 1902) (M 198.28)
Lot 270: James VI 40 shillings (1582) (A.1911.506.1195)

Murdoch sale II (Sotheby's 11–13 May 1903) (M 201.25)
Lot 4: Henry, Earl of Northumberland, sterling / penny, Stewart III, ex Pollexfen, Murchison (A.1911.506.1066)
Lot 5: Malcolm IV sterling / penny, Stewart III, ex Pollexfen (A.1911.506.1068)
Lot 17: William the Lion penny, third coinage (A.1911.506.1067)
Lot 24: Alexander III penny, first coinage, Baldwin III (A.1911.506.1069)
Lot 32: Alexander III penny, first coinage, Baldwin VI (A.1911.506.1070)
Lot 35: Alexander III sterling / penny, second coinage, Ma/A1, ex Addington, Wingate (A.1911.506.1071)
Lot 37: Alexander III halfpenny (A.1911.506.1075)
Lot 60: Robert II groat, Dundee, ex Addington, Wingate (A.1911.506.1080)
Lot 62: Robert II half-groat, Dundee, ex Addington, Wingate (A.1911.506.1081)
Lot 112: James II groat, second coinage, first issue (A.1911.506.1101)
Lot 147: James IV groat, heavy coinage, Stewart II, Murray R, ex Richardson (?), Addington, Wingate (A.1911.506.1117)
Lot 184: James V one-third ducat / bonnet piece (1540), ex Addington, Wingate (A.1911.506.1123)
Lot 235: Mary and Henry one-third ryal (1365) (A.1911.506.1139)
Lot 245: James VI one-third ryal (1570) (A.1911.506.1192)
Lot 251: James VI 16 shillings (1581), ex Addington, Wingate (A.1911.506.1193)
Lot 252: James VI 8 shillings (1581) (A.1911.506.1194)
Lot 254: James VI 30 shillings (1582) (A.1911.506.1196)
Lot 270: James VI lion noble (1586), ex Addington (A.1911.506.1176)
Lot 272: James VI two-thirds lion noble (1584) (A.1911.506.1177)
Lot 274: James VI one-third lion noble (1584), ex Richardson (?), Addington, Wingate (A.1911.506.1178)
Lot 336: Charles I half-unit, third coinage, Briot's issue (A.1911.506.1213)

Dowells' sale, Edinburgh, 12–13 December 1899 (M 188.54)
Lot 401: Mary testoon, first period, type IIb (1553) (A.1911.506.1141)
Lot 404: Mary half-testoon, first period, type III (1556) (A.1911.506.1142)
Lot 407: Mary and Francis half-testoon, second variety (1560) (A.1911.506.1155)
Lot 437: James IV unicorn, Murray Y (lb) (A.1911.506.1107)
Lot 443: James VI hat piece (1593) (A.1911.506.1180)
Lot 448: James VI thistle crown (A.1911.506.1189)

Dowells' sale, Edinburgh, 12 June 1905 (M –)
Lot 401: Robert I sterling / penny (A.1911.506.1076)

Dowells' sale, Edinburgh, 22 October or 22 December 1906 (M –)
Lot 158: James VI two-thirds ryal (1570) (A.1911.506.1191)
Lot 159: James VI 60 shillings, second post-Union issue (A.1911.506.1203)
England, to the death of Queen Anne

Montagu sale, English part II (Sotheby's 11–16 May 1896) (M 178.18)
Lot 817: Edward VI pattern crown, ex Brice, Hugh Howard (A.1911.506.148)

Montagu sale, English part III (Sotheby's 13–20 November 1896) (M 179.34)
Lot 36: Elizabeth I ryal (now identified as a Dutch imitation), ex Brice (A.1911-506.172)
Lot 294: Charles I crown, Group III (portcullis), ex Brice, Wigan, Durrant (A.1911.506.250)
Lot 985: Anne pattern guinea (1710) (A.1911.506.481)

Montagu sale, English part V (Sotheby's 16–20 November 1897) (M 181.46)
Lot 384: Charles I unite, Oxford (1644), ex Wylie (A.1911.506.237)

Although these items from the Montagu sales definitely formed part of the Lindsay Carnegie collection, it is not certain that they were acquired directly. Nothing in the surviving records demonstrates that he was a bidder. Buyer's names are not recorded in the RNS/BNS library copies of the sale II catalogue, but the coins listed above from sales III and V were bought by Spink, who may have been acting for Lindsay Carnegie. However, lot 713 in sale III (a Cromwell pattern 50 shillings) was also bought by Spink, but was acquired by Brunning, from whose sale Lindsay Carnegie subsequently purchased it (see below).

Durlacher sale (Sotheby's 20–23 March 1899) (M 186.15)
Lot 182: James I spur ryal (A.1911.506.211)
Lot 205: James I half-angel (A.1911.506.214)
Lot 257: Charles I half-sovereign / double crown (A.1911.506.235)
Lot 279: Charles I £3 piece / triple unite, Oxford (1642) (A.1911.506.230)
Lot 398: Anne 5 guineas (1703 VIGO) (A.1911.506.478)

Moon sale (Sotheby's 7–10 May 1901) (M 195.20)
Lot 65: Richard II hardi, Bordeaux, ex Marsam-Townshend (A.1911.506.67)

(Three other Anglo-Gallic gold coins - lots 52, 55 and 59, all purchased by Lincoln - appear from the printed descriptions to be in the Lindsay Carnegie collection.)

Temple sale (Sotheby's 26 November 1901) (M 196.45)
Lot 103: Anne pattern halfpenny (Peck 724) (A.1911.506.511)

A further eleven coins of this period in the Lindsay Carnegie collection match the printed descriptions of lots purchased by Lincoln, but none can definitely be identified.

Cholmley sale (Sotheby's 26–30 May 1902) (M 198.28)
Lot 42: Charles I pattern sovereign / unite by Briot (1630), ex Thomas, Cuff, Shepherd (A.1911.506.233)
Lot 46: Charles I half-sovereign / double crown by Briot (A.1911.506.235)

Murdoch sale I (Sotheby's 31 March, 1–4 April 1903) (M 201.18)
Lot 347: Edward IV ryal / rose noble, Coventry (A.1911.506.92)
Lot 353: Edward IV half-ryal / half rose noble, York, ex Montagu, Brice, Lord Hastings, Martin (A.1911.506.96)
Lot 476: Edward VI half-crown / half-quarter-sovereign, ex Richardson, Marsam-Townshend (A.1911.506.149)
Lot 530: Edward VI pattern half-sovereign, ex Montagu, Addington, Murchison (A.1911.506.146)
Lot 692: James I spur ryal, ex Montagu, Brice, Lord Hastings, Cuff (A.1911.506.212)

Murdoch sale III (Sotheby's 8–13 June 1903) (M 201.32)
Lot 62: Charles I half-unite, Oxford (1643), ex H. Clark, Briggs (A.1911.506.238)
Lot 139: Charles I half-crown, Briot's first issue, ex Montagu, Brice, Wigan (A.1911.506.258)
Lot 341: 'Colchester siege money shilling' (actually Scarborough and probably a late souvenir or fantasy piece), ex Montagu, Addington, Bergme (A.1911.506.294)
Lot 452: Cromwell 'half broad (1656) by Simon' (actually a pattern restrike by Tanner (1738)), ex Clark, Marsam-Townshend (A.1911.506.321)
Lot 677: Charles II pattern farthing in pewter, ex Montagu, Brice, Wigan (A.1911.506.363)
Lot 685: Charles II pattern farthing in pewter (1676), ex Shorthouse (A.1911.506.364)
Lot 886: Anne pattern shilling by Croker (1710), ex Montagu, Brice, Hugh Howard (A.1911.506.492)

Many other coins in the Lindsay Carnegie collection match the printed descriptions of lots purchased by Lincoln at these two sales, but no others can definitely be identified.

Anon / 'Nobleman' / 'Marquess of Ailesbury' sale (Sotheby’s 29–30 June 1903 (M 202.38)
Lot 105: Charles II silver pattern farthings (1676, Peck 492); six specimens, of which five now in collection (A.1911.506.387–391)

Brunning sale (Sotheby’s 18 March 1908) (M 213.10)
Lot 3: Charles I crown (A.1911.506.249)
Lot 5: Cromwell pattern 50 shillings (1656), ex R.M. Foster, Montagu, Wigan, Brice, Edmonds, Earl of Pembroke (A.1911.506.322)

Great Britain, George I to Edward VII

Preston sale (Sotheby’s 2 November 1900) (M 194.47)
Lot 112: 5 x George III crowns (1818 LVIII. LXIX, 1819 lx, LX, 1820) (A.1911.506.642 or 644, 643, 646, 647 or 648, 649 or 650)

Moon sale (Sotheby’s 7–10 May 1901) (M 195.20)
Although no coins of this period can definitely be identified as from this sale, there are a large number of proof and pattern pieces in the Lindsay Carnegie collection which match lots purchased by Lincoln.

Temple sale (Sotheby’s 26 November 1901) (M 196.43)
Lot 137: George III proof shilling (1787) on thick flan (A.1911.506.655)
A further eight coins of this period in the Lindsay Carnegie collection match the printed descriptions of lots purchased by Lincoln, but none can definitely be identified.

Cholmley sale (Sotheby’s 26–30 May 1902) (M 198.28)
Lot 135: George I pattern guinea (1727), ex Richardson (A.1911.506.517)

Murdoch sale IV (Sotheby’s 21–25, 27–30 July 1903) (M 202.43)
Lot 663: Victoria, gold pattern penny (1860) (A.1911.506.837)

Murdoch sale V (Sotheby’s 15–19 March 1904) (M 203.11)
Lot 121: George III pattern 5 guineas by Yeo (A.1911.506.600)
Lot 407: George IV pattern half-crown by Pistrucci (1822), ex Bieber (A.1911.506.732)
Many other coins in the Lindsay Carnegie collection match the printed descriptions of lots purchased by Lincoln at these two sales, but no others can definitely be identified.

Brunning sale (Sotheby’s 18 March 1908) (M 213.10)

Other sources

Lindsay Carnegie’s tickets for the following four coins provide another small insight into his life. Since all were apparently won as bets, it may be surmised that they were acquired as circulating currency rather than as collectors’ pieces, and this is in itself a pointer to the age and condition of coins in circulation in Scotland at the end of the nineteenth century.
George III half-crown (1817–20), very worn and perforated: ticket reads ‘Won from Tom Morris May 18th 1895’ (A.1911.506.653)

George IV half-crown (1825), fairly worn and perforated: ticket reads ‘This half crown was won from old Tom Morris by D L Carnegie 1892’ (A.1911.506.733)

Victoria half-crown (1846), worn: ticket reads ‘Won from lam Inglis at golf on my birthday July 9th 1898.match An Kirkcaldy & self v. Iam Inglis & Ted Blackwell. Won match by 4 & 3 & one bye’. (A.1911.506.872)

Victoria half-crown (1895), slight wear: ticket reads ‘Won from Ted Blackwell at Golf on my birthday. And Kirkcaldy & self v. Ted B & Iam Inglis. Won by 4 & 3 & one bye 9th July 1898’ (A.1911.506.870)

Ireland

Rae sale (Sotheby’s 23–24 June 1898) (M 184.38)
Lot 254: ‘Inchiquin’ crown (1642) (A.1911.506.298)

Murdoch sale VII (Sotheby’s 12–13 December 1904) (M 206.57)
Lot 31: George III pattern penny (1813, Dowle / Finn 611), ex Montagu, Brice (A.1911.506.707)
Lot 35: George IV pattern penny (1822, Dowle / Finn 632), ex Copp (A.1911.506.760)

British colonial

Lowsley sale (Sotheby’s 3–4 May 1899) (M 186.23)
Lot 313: Ceylon, copper-gilt proof stiver, half-stiver, quarter-stiver (1802, Pr2. 50-51. 83B, 86B, 87B) (A.1911.506.2747, 2749, 2751)

Deakin sale (Sotheby’s 15–16 November 1899) (M 187.48)
Lot 187: ‘Rosa Americana’ twopence (1723) (A.1911.506.1333)
Lot 257: India, copper pattern mohur / rupee (1828, Pr4/1. 178.336) (A.1911.506.2658)

Green, Boulton et al sale (Sotheby’s 30 November, 1–2 December 1899) (M 188.52)
Lot 485: India – Bengal Presidency, pattern 1 pie (1809, Pr4/1. 269–70. 389) (A.1911.506.2662); Madras Presidency, proof 1/48 rupee, 1/96 rupee (1794, Pr4/1. 88–89. 311, 322) (A.1911.506.2672, 2674), proof 20 cash (1808, Pr4/1. 74–75. 194), proof 10 cash, 5 cash (1803, Pr4/1. 74–75. 200, 209) (A.1911.506.2675, 2676, 2683); Ceylon, copper proof stiver, half-stiver, quarter-stiver (1802, Pr2. 50–51. 83A, 86A, 87A) (A.1911.506.2748, 2750, 2752)

Temple sale (Sotheby’s 26 November 1901) (M 196.45)
Lot 146: Barbados, restrike proof pennies (1788, 1792), halfpenny (1792) (A.1911.506.1357, 1358, 1359)

L.C. Wyon sale (Sotheby’s 12–13 December 1901) (M 197.51)
Lot 45: India, silver proof set of mohur, 10 and 5 rupees (1870) (A.1911.506.2486, 2487, 2488)

(2488) (This provenance has been deduced from the fact that (a) three coins meeting this description form part of the Lindsay Carnegie collection, and (b) the words ‘Wyon sale Cat no 45’ appear, in semi-erased pencil, on the back of the ticket associated with a William IV pattern groat. It seems likely that Lindsay Carnegie wrote two tickets in error and re-used one of them.)

Cholmley sale (Sotheby’s 26–30 May 1902) (M 198.28)
Lot 341: Essequibo and Demerara, 3, 2 guilders, guilder, half-guilder, quarter-guilder (1816) (A.1911.506.1372–1377)

Leslie-Ellis sale (Sotheby’s 18–19 June 1902) (M 198.33)
Lot 147: India – Madras Presidency, 2 × 1 cash (1678, Pr4/1. 63. 92) (A.1911.506.2656, 2657)
Lot 265: South Africa – Griquatown, halfpenny and farthing (nd – 1815–16) (A.1911.506.1316, 1317)

(The 5 and 10 pence of this series (A.1911.506.1314, 1315) probably came from lot 264, but this can not be proven.)

Chaffer, Wright et al sale (Sotheby’s 28–30 October 1902) (M 199.50)
Lot 426: Carolina, ‘elephant’ token (1694) (A.1911.506.1332)
THE LINDSAY CARNEGIE COLLECTION

Murdoch sale IV (Sotheby’s 21–25, 27–30 July 1903) (M 202.43)

Lot 36: Gibraltar, 16 copper coins and tokens (1802–42) (There are 17 in the collection (A.1911.506.1282–1298), of which 11 have Lindsay Carnegie’s tickets – perhaps the total in the catalogue was incorrect.)

Lot 134: India, gold proof rupee (1891, restrrike, see Pr4/2.193) (A.1911.506.2502)

Lot 146: India gold proof half-rupee, quarter-rupee, 2 annas (1891, restrrike, see Pr4/2.193) (A.1911.506.2490, 2493, 2495)

Lot 325: Indonesia – Maluka, 4 x duitis (1813) (A.1911.506.2828–31)

Lot 437: 3 x ‘Rosa Americana’ halfpennies (2 x 1722, 1723) (A.1911.506.1334–36)

Lot 536: Barbados, halfpenny token of Moses Tolanto (A.1911.506.1360)

A few other Lincoln purchases at this sale may also be Lindsay Carnegie coins, but this cannot definitely be established.

Foreign

Green, Boulton et al sale (Sotheby’s 30 November, 1–2 December 1899) (M 188.52)

Lot 353: France, 8 x Napoleon I 5 francs (1806, 1807, 1808 x 2, 1811, 1812 x 2, 1815) (7 coins now in collection, A.1911.506.1500–6; one 1812 specimen missing)

L.C. Wyon sale (Sotheby’s 12–13 December 1901 (M 197.51)

Lot 95: Peru, proofs of sol, half sol, one-fifth sol, dinero, half dinero, 2 centavos (x 2), centavo (x 2) (1886) (actually pattern strikings of Wyon’s designs – see above) (A.1911.506.1957–61, 1963–6). (There can be little doubt that these exceptionally rare items, purchased by Lincoln, are the Lindsay Carnegie specimens, although there is no definite evidence.)

Murdoch sale IV (Sotheby’s 21–25, 27–30 July 1903) (M 202.43)

Lot 677: U.S.A. – California, octagonal gold 50 dollars (A.1911.506.1845) (There is no definite proof of this attribution, but the detailed written description in the catalogue matches this specimen exactly.)

Lot 1001: ‘U.S.A., Washington pattern penny or double cent (1795)’ (actually a Middlesex token, Dalton and Hamer 1052b) (A.1911.506.1836)


Lot 1081: Chile, gold pesos (1863, 1864) (A.1911.506.1925–6), silver pesos (1878, 1895) (A.1911.506.1928–9), proof set of 1 peso, 50 centavos, 20 centavos, half decimo (1868) (the 20 and 5 centavos are actually dated 1867) (A.1911.506.1927, 1930–2), copper proof set of 1 centavo (x 2) and medio centavo (1835) (A.1911.506.1933–5)

Lot 1082: Colombia, gold quito (1835) (now in collection), silver patterns for gold 1, 2, 5, 10, 30 pesos (the last actually 20 pesos), and for silver half decimo, 2, 5 decimos and 1 peso (A.1911.506.1937–45). (As with the Peruvian pattern set listed above, there is no definite proof that these coins, described as ‘from L.C. Wyon’s collection’ and forming lot 90 in the December 1901 sale, are the Lindsay Carnegie specimens, although in view of their extreme rarity, and the fact that they were purchased by Lincoln, there is little room for doubt.)

Lot 1090: France, Louis XIII gold 8 louis d’or (1640) (A.1911.506.1483)

Lot 1096: France, Napoleon I silver pattern 5 francs (1815) by Droz (A.1911.506.1507)

Lot 1181: South Africa – Orange Free State, silver pattern Kroon (1887 and copper pattern penny (A.1911.506.1819–20)

Lot 1198: Russia, Alexander II silver proof set of rouble, poletka, 25, 20, 15, 10, 5 kopecks (1871) (5 kopecks is actually dated 1870) (A.1911.506.1721, 1723–8), copper proof set of 5, 3, 2 kopecks, 1 kopeck, half and quarter kopeck (1870) (quarter kopeck is actually dated 1867) (A.1911.506.1735, 1737, 1739–42)

A few other Lincoln purchases at this sale may be Lindsay Carnegie coins, but this can not definitely be established.

Other source